

# Minutes



OF A MEETING OF THE

## Planning Committee

HELD AT 6.00PM ON 18 NOVEMBER 2009

AT COUNCIL OFFICES, CROWMARSH GIFFORD

### Present:

Mrs P Slatter (Chairman)

Mr G Andrews, Ms J Bland, Mr F Bloomfield, Mr D Bretherton, Mr P Cross, Mr C Daukes (as substitute for Mr I Lokhon), Capt J Flood, Ms E Gillespie, Mr A Hodgson, Mrs A Midwinter, Mr R Peasgood, Mr R Peirce, Mr A Rooke, Mrs M Turner

### Apologies:

Apologies were submitted by Mr I Lokhon

### Officers:

Ms E Bowerman, Mr S Corrigan, Mr T Dean, Mr M Gulliford, Mrs E Hamerton, Mr P Lucas, Mrs H Moore, Miss J Randle, Mr T Wyatt

Prior to the start of the meeting the committee and members of the public observed a minutes silence in memory of Mr T Buckett, MBE

## 66. Minutes

**RESOLVED:** to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 28 October 2009 as a correct record and to agree that the Chairman sign them.

## 67. Proposals for site visits

**RESOLVED:** to undertake a site visit in respect of application P09/E0846 Corporation Yard, Park Terrace, Thame to assess the impact of the proposal on the residents of Park Terrace.

Miss J Randle, Planning Manager, informed the committee of proposed site visits to:

- Oxford Brookes boathouse, Cholsey - P09/W0518
- Marsh Bridge Cottages, Didcot - P09/W0956

All of the above site visits will be held on Monday 14 December prior to the meeting on Wednesday 16 December.

## **68. P09/W0670 Land adjacent to Haydown, Elvendon Road, Goring on Thames**

Mrs P Slatter, a local ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the debate or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application for planning permission for a detached house and garage on land adjacent to Haydown, Elvendon Road, Goring on Thames.

The planning officer updated the committee on consultation responses received since the publication of her report. In response to additional information provided by the architect for the applicant on the street scene drawing, Goring Parish Council remained concerned about the reduced open space between the proposed new dwelling and Haydown. The Parish Council also maintained its objection to the location of the garage in front of the proposed dwelling and considers that the dwelling is both incongruous to its setting and an inappropriate design for the road. The planning officer also reported comments received from the neighbour at Shepherds clarifying their consultation response. The neighbour had withdrawn their objection to a door on the first floor level of the west facing elevation when this was replaced with a proposal for an obscure glazed window. The neighbour had not stated that the proposed house would have an overbearing impact on them but had expressed the view that they did not have the expertise to express a view on this issue and had requested that officers do so.

The planning officer proposed an additional condition to ensure the garage accommodation remained as a home office and garage and could not be converted to living accommodation. She also proposed additional wording to condition 13 to include the provision of a screen on the west side of the balcony.

Mr P Mortimer, representing Goring Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr A Gould, the agent for the applicant, spoke in support of the application and confirmed the applicant's agreement to the additional conditions.

Mrs A Ducker and Mrs P Slatter, ward councillors, addressed the committee on this application.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P09/W0670 subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement within three years
2. Sample materials
3. Turning area and parking to be provided before occupation

4. Vehicular access to be provided in accordance with the approved plans
5. Landscaping scheme
6. Protection of trees and hedges
7. Slab heights to be approved to demonstrate compliance with drawing 680.09.09 P/12 A
8. Hours of operation during construction
9. Control of external lighting
10. Sustainable design to be in accordance with the Design and Access Statement
11. Withdraw permitted development rights – outbuildings, enclosures, swimming pools
12. Withdraw permitted development rights – no additional windows to be inserted on east and west elevations
13. Obscure glazing, windows in east and west elevation, and provision of screen on west side of the balcony (details to submitted and approved)
14. Contaminated land investigation
15. Garage to remain as a home office and garage.

## **69. P09/E0763 & PO9/E0764/LB The Barn, 1 High Street, Nettlebed**

The committee considered applications for planning permission and listed building consent for the change of use from retail to dwelling incorporating the insertion of new doors to the southern elevation at The Barn, 1 High Street, Nettlebed.

Ms J Alexander, local resident, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr A Gould, the agent for the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

The planning officer proposed a further condition to the planning application to remove permitted development rights for the installation of additional windows in the western elevation to protect the amenity of the neighbours at 1 High Street, Nettlebed.

A motion moved and seconded with an additional condition to obscure glaze the bedroom window in the western elevation to further protect the amenity of the neighbours at 1 High Street, Nettlebed on being put was declared carried.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P09/E0763 subject to the following conditions:

1. Standard three year time limit
2. New internal and external works and making good to match existing fabric
3. Details of joinery at 1:5 prior to commencement
4. Windows to remain boarded for duration of residential use
5. Sustainable measures to be implemented prior to occupation
6. Details of Waste Management measures prior to commencement

7. Remove permitted development rights for additional windows on the western elevation
8. Obscure glaze bedroom window in western elevation.

To grant listed building consent for application P09/E0764/LB subject to the following conditions:

1. Standard three year time limit
2. New internal and external works and making good to match existing fabric
3. Details of joinery at 1:5 prior to commencement.

### **70. TPO 13/2009 20 Castle Street, Wallingford**

The committee considered an objection to the confirmation of TPO 13/2009 at 20 Castle Street, Wallingford.

Mr M Devetta, local resident, spoke objecting to the tree preservation order.

**RESOLVED:** to confirm TPO 13/2009 at 20 Castle Street, Wallingford.

### **71. P09/E0720, P09/E0721/LB & P09/E0739/CA 38 Market Place, Henley on Thames**

Ms J Bland, a local ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the debate or voting on this item.

The committee considered applications for planning permission (change of use, demolition, conversion and alterations to former police station, to form a restaurant (A3 use), two houses and two upper level flats), conservation area consent (demolition of rear (north-side) outbuilding; removal of section of boundary wall adjacent to the outbuilding (along Kings Road)) and listed building consent (works affecting guttering/rainwater and roof tiling of adjacent listed building, including foundation construction adjacent to listed wall) at 38 Market Place, Henley on Thames.

The planning officer reported the receipt of an indicative noise survey giving the existing background noise levels for the area.

Ms L Hillier, representative of Henley Town Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr N Laister, Ms K Hawes and Mr Stacey, agent, consultant and architect for the application, spoke in support of the application.

Ms J Bland, a local ward councillor, addressed the committee on this item.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P09/E0720 subject to imposition of the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years
2. Sample of all materials to be submitted and agreed, including sample panel
3. Rainwater goods to be metal
4. Details of gates to be submitted and approved
5. Boundary wall and gable details to be submitted to and agreed
6. Withdrawal of permitted development rights for alterations and extensions to dwellings
7. Surface water drainage to be submitted and agreed
8. Bicycle parking provision
9. Recycle and waste facilities to be provided
10. Construction phase travel management plan to be submitted and agreed
11. Noise and odour control techniques from kitchen extraction unit and other mechanical services to be submitted and approved
12. Details to control noise breakout from the building to be submitted and approved
13. Sound proofing measures to be submitted and agreed
14. Obscured glazing to be inserted and retained
15. No waste of recycled materials to be deposited in outside receptacles after 18:00 or before 08:00 on any day
16. No deliveries or collection by trade vehicles to take place after 18:00 or before 08:00 on any day
17. Hours of use not to exceed 09:00 to midnight on Sundays to Thursdays and 9:00 to 01:00 the following day for Fridays to Saturdays
18. Control of external lighting
19. Contamination investigation and remediation if required
20. Archaeological investigation
21. Additional bat surveys to be undertaken and license obtained
22. Renewable energy measures to be incorporated.

To grant listed building consent of planning application P09/E0721/LB subject to the imposition of the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years
2. All new works and works of making good to the retained internal and external fabric to be finished to match the adjacent work
3. Foundation details adjacent to listed wall to be submitted and agreed.

To grant conservation area consent of planning application P09/E0739/CA subject to the following conditions:

1. Three year time limit

2. Demolition not to take place until planning permission granted for re-development, and contract for redevelopment entered into
3. The demolition of the garage block be carried out with due care for the retained structures and the listed wall. All works of making good to match the existing.

## **72. P09/E0846 Corporation Yard, Park Terrace, Thame**

Deferred for a site visit (see minute 67/11/09).

## **73. P09/E1015 Land to the rear of 9 Hazelton Close, Thame**

Mrs A Midwinter, a local ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the debate or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application for planning permission for the demolition of an existing garage and shed and the construction of a two storey detached dwelling at land to the rear of 9 Hazelton Close, Thame.

Mrs A Midwinter, a local ward councillor, addressed the committee on this item.

Whilst a number of councillors expressed support for the officer's recommendation of refusal others expressed the view that the proposal would not have a detrimental impact on the Conservation Area or the character and historic integrity of the burgage plot the appearance of which would be improved with the removal of the existing garage and shed and the proposed restoration work to the wall.

**RESOLVED on the casting vote of the Chairman:** to refuse planning permission for application P09/E1015 for the following reason:

The proposed development is located on a burgage plot within the Thame Conservation Area. The proposed development, due to its siting, design, size and bulk, would fail to preserve the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and the open character and appearance of the Conservation Areas and the open character and historic integrity of the burgage plot. As a result, the proposal would be contrary to Policies G2, G6, D1, H4, CON7 and CON10 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011 and guidance contained within the South Oxfordshire Design Guide 2008 and PPS1, PPS3 and PPG15.

## **74. P09/E1055 Tesco Store, 359 Reading Road, Henley on Thames**

The committee considered an application for planning permission for a variation to condition 2 (restriction on car park lighting) of planning permission P97/S0467 to allow the car parking lighting to be switched on between 7.00am and 10.30pm and

for a 24 hour period between 14 December and 3 January each year at Tesco Store, 359 Reading Road, Henley on Thames.

Ms L Hillier, representative of Henley Town Council, spoke objecting to the application.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P09/E1055 subject to the following conditions:

1. That the car park lighting shall not be switched on until 07.00 and shall be switched off at 22.30 or half an hour after the store closes for trade, whichever is the earlier. This condition will not apply between 14 December and 3 January for external lighting to be first agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
2. No further external lighting shall be installed at the site unless details of the lighting have first been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

## **75. P09/E1039 & P09/E1040/LB Navigators, Wharfe Lane, Henley on Thames**

Ms J Bland declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item as the applicant is a close acquaintance. She withdrew from the meeting and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered applications for planning permission and listed building consent for a first floor conservatory above the existing terrace at Navigators, Wharfe Lane, Henley on Thames.

Ms L Hillier, representative of Henley Town Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr R Bleackley, local resident, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr A Trotman, applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Despite the officer's recommendation of approval a number of councillors expressed the view that the proposal would, due to its design and size, have a detrimental impact on the amenity of neighbours, detract from the setting of the listed building and have a detrimental impact on the streetscene.

Motions moved and seconded to approve both applications on being put were declared not carried.

Motions moved and seconded to refuse both applications were declared carried on being put to the vote.

**RESOLVED:** to refuse planning permission for application P09/E10309 for the following reasons:

1. Having regard to the design of the proposed first floor conservatory, the expanse of glazing and its position directly adjacent to the lane, the proposal would result in an incongruous and intrusive feature that would detract from the character and appearance of the surrounding conservation area. As such, the proposal would be contrary to the provisions of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies G2, G6, H13, D1 and CON7, the advice in the South Oxfordshire Design Guide 2008 and national guidance in PPG15.
2. Having regard to the design of the proposed conservatory, its position at first floor and the ratio of brickwork to glazing, the proposal would fail to respect the special historic and architectural interest of the listed building and would detract from its setting. As such, the proposal would be contrary to the provisions of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies G2, G6, H13, D1, CON2, CON3 and CON5, the advice in the South Oxfordshire Design Guide 2008 and national guidance in PPG15.
3. Having regard to the position of the proposed first floor conservatory, opposite a bedroom and kitchen window of No.6 Wharfe Lane, the proposal would have an oppressive and overbearing impact on the outlook from these rooms and would impact on the level of light within them. As such, the proposal would be contrary to the provisions of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan, particularly policies H13 and D4 and the advice in the South Oxfordshire Design Guide 2008.

To refuse listed building consent for application P09/1040/LB for the following reason:

Having regard to the design of the proposed conservatory, its position at first floor and the ratio of brickwork to glazing, the proposal would fail to respect the special historic and architectural interest of the listed building. As such, the proposal would be contrary to the provisions of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies CON2 and CON3 and CON5 and national guidance in PPG15.

The meeting closed at 9.05pm

Chairman